Ann Beheler, Collin College
Helen Sullivan, Collin College

Innovations Conference 2016

SUSTAINABILITY PLANNING FROM PROPOSAL THROUGH IMPLEMENTATION TO POST-GRANT
Who Are We?

Developed by National Convergence Technology Center
National Science Foundation (NSF) Advanced
Technological Education (ATE) Center led by Collin College

- 2004 forward
- Consortium with 50+ college and university partners
- Primarily in the area of networking infrastructure/mobility/data communications
- Developed to address the downturn in IT in the early 2000’s
- Designed with lock-step cooperation with regional and now national business to ensure employment for graduates
CTC Partners

El Centro College
DALLAS COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT

UNT UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS
Discover the power of ideas.

Collin College

OTC

Florida State College at Jacksonville

Fox Valley Technical College
Knowledge That Works

Georgia Southern University

Lansing Community College
Where Success Begins
Why Focus on Sustainability?

- Grants are designed to support
  - New initiatives that are expected to work based on best educated guess by experienced personnel and supporting research, if any
  - Work over a stated period
- Grants are not designed to support
  - “Maintenance” activities (the word “continue” is a red flag)
  - Ongoing activities
- For all grants
  - Grantees are expected to be right about many new initiatives and are expected to sustain some or all of the work on an ongoing basis
  - Sustainability plans may be required to be described in the proposal
Example: NSF ATE grant solicitation

NSF Requires [NSF 14-577, June 2014]

...expected to communicate a realistic vision for sustainability.

...expected that at least some aspects of both centers and projects will be sustained or institutionalized past the period of award funding.
Sustainability Definitions Similar

- NSF: “Being sustainable means that a project or center has developed a product or service that the host institution, its partners, and its target audiences want continued.”

- DOL: Looks for evidence of a grantee’s planning to “integrate these strategies and activities into their non-grant funded program(s) for continued success.”
Choices for Sustainability

- An institution commits to institutionalize curriculum
- An institution commits to maintaining some of the positions hired by a grant funded project using college ongoing funds
- Project partners agree to supply external resources to fund project components after funding ends
- Other organizations or educational institutions commit to continuing to use, improve, and disseminate curricula or other materials developed during the project
For Each New Initiative

- Determine likely method for sustaining
- Determine stakeholders
- Determine what is needed to make the case for sustaining (Note: Full Experimental or Quasi-experimental research is not necessarily required)
- Determine data to be collected and collect it regularly
Case Study # 1: SC ATE Internships

- Grant funded
- Industry Consortium

Developed By-laws
Placed interns in member companies

SC ATE = South Carolina ATE
SC ATE Internship Program

Funding ended & sustained by other center funding

Lessons learned

- Time Commitment must go down
- Faculty can’t run Internship Program
- Must be multidisciplinary

Transitioned to Institution because program was valued by college
Case Study #2: Working Connections Faculty PD

- Week-long intensive training for IT faculty
- Goal is to be able to teach an entirely new subject
- Originally funded by AACC/Microsoft
- Continued on cost-recovery basis upon expiry of original grant (2004)
- Supported through Convergence Technology Center and other grants since then
Basis for Sustaining?

- What happens when NSF funding ends?
- What data is needed for sustaining?
- Who are the stakeholders?
- What do you think?
Case Study #3: Community of Practice

- Convergence Technology Center mentoring Community of Practice (now Convergence College Network)
- In existence since 2006 but has evolved from hub and spoke to mesh network
- Supported through NSF funding so far
Basis for Sustaining?

- What happens when NSF funding ends?
- What data is needed for sustaining?
- Who are the stakeholders?
- What do you think?
Business & Industry Leadership Team replaced Business Advisory Councils about 12 years ago

Business representatives from industry use structured process to let faculty know the knowledge areas (actually KSAs) they want graduates to have 12-36 mo. in future

Funded by grants so far
Basis for Sustaining?

- What happens when NSF funding ends?
- What data is needed for sustaining?
- Who are the stakeholders?
- What do you think?
Case Study #5: NISGTC Career Coaches/Tutors

- Career Coach & Tutors for above DOL grant
  - Data was kept on student usage of career services
  - Comparing students who utilized grant services such as career coaches, tutors, test prep software versus those who did not, fall to spring retention almost doubled
  - Focus groups to back up Institutional Research data with qualitative data
# NISGTC Retention Rates Fall to Spring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Use Career Services</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used Career Services</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Completion of credential increased, likely due to career coach intervention (but could not prove that)

Stakeholders – who do you think they were?

Request was for 2 Career Coaches on hard money; based on data this was increased to 3 with support from business
Case Study #6: Curriculum and Equipment

- Curriculum institutionalized through implementation into programs
  - Stakeholders?
  - Costs?

- Virtual Lab plus all small and large equipment will be supported by IT
  - Stakeholders?
  - Maintenance costs
  - Personnel to support (required training and transition)
Other Case Studies, Time Permitting

- Moraine Valley Community College petition to graduate fee waived for NISGTC participants
  - Dramatically increased certificate and degree #'s
  - Now college-wide

- Bellevue College tutoring program
  - Career Center kept it going without additional funds
Tips to Consider in Planning Sustainability

- From the beginning, determine which components of your work will likely have impact and could/should be sustained over time and why.

- Will sustainability be through institutionalization, funding through the college budget, in-kind from partners, donations or a combination?

- Gather data to support potential requests for funding from the beginning, and don’t be afraid to expand or contract data collection.

- Talk with other staff, business partners, administrators, other PIs and Directors about sustainability regularly to help to develop your plans.

- Continually refine your Sustainability Plans based on data, and be sure to present data to those who make budget decisions in time for those decisions to be made.
More Sustainability Resources?

- Indicators of the sustainability of NSF's Advanced Technological Education Program
- Keep the Ball Rolling: Sustaining Projects Through Dissemination
- Searching for Sustainability: Strategies from Eight Digitized Special Collections
- End Games: The Challenge of Sustainability
- For these resources and more visit http://atecentral.net/sustainability
To Get Technical Assistance:

The NSF National Convergence Technology Center (IT and Communications)

Join the Convergence College Network and obtain many benefits including mentoring

Details https://www.connectedtech.org
Technical Assistance

Collin is lead for the Centers Collaborative for Technical Assistance (NSF sponsored)

Webinars, best practices, and convenings are provided for DOL and NSF grantees and others leading workforce programs

For more information:
http://www.atecenters.org/ccta
abeheleer@collin.edu
Sustainability Research: Reports

- 5 reports from 2000-2011
  - Institutionalization and Sustainability of the National Science Foundations Advanced Technological Education Program
  - Sustainability: Increasing the Likelihood of a Long-Term Impact by the ATE Program
  - A Conference on Self-Sustainability
  - Measuring the Sustainability of the Advanced Technological Education (ATE) Program
  - Ithaca Case Studies in Sustainability
This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. 1205077. Any opinions, findings and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.